РОЗДІЛ 1 МЕХАНІЗМИ ПУБЛІЧНОГО УПРАВЛІННЯ

UDC 351:354;342;321

DOI https://doi.org/10.51547/ppp.dp.ua/2021.5.1

Drahomyretska Nataliia Mykhailivna,

Doctor of Public Administration, Professor, Professor at the Department of Humanitarian and Socio-Political Sciences, Odesa Regional Institute for Public Administration, National Academy for Public Administration under the President of Ukraine ORCID ID: 0000-0001-5713-6724

Romanenko Yevhen Oleksandrovych,

Doctor of Public Administration, Professor, Vice Rector for Scientific Affairs, National Aviation University ORCID ID: 0000-0003-2285-0543

Chukut Svitlana Anatoliivna.

Doctor of Public Administration, Professor, Professor at the Department of Theory and Practice of Management,
National Technical University of Ukraine "Igor Sikorsky Kyiv Polytechnic Institute"
ORCID ID: 0000-0001-9829-0218

ORGANIZATIONAL AND LEGAL CONTEXT OF THE GOVERNMENT OF UKRAINE'S ACTIVITY ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

ОРГАНІЗАЦІЙНО-ПРАВОВИЙ КОНТЕКСТ ДІЯЛЬНОСТІ УРЯДУ УКРАЇНИ ЗІ СТАЛОГО РОЗВИТКУ

The issue of sustainable development has become very popular not only in research but also in practice recently. There are changes in views, approaches, and positions. New documents have been appearing in the political sphere of states on sustainable development and its achievement. Extensive discussions are held in scientific and political circles on the understanding of sustainable development and its conceptual justification. Statistics are provided, advisory bodies with public representation are created, state bodies responsible for sustainable development are determined, and so on. State reports on such activities are presented in international forums to demonstrate best practices. Certainly, this issue is debatable. Ukraine is introducing the experience of foreign countries. In fact, Ukraine acts as importers of foreign experience and try to adapt it to the domestic socio-cultural tradition. Unfortunately, Ukraine is not an exporter of its own experience and does not offer achievements in sustainable development to other states. According to this situation, foreign concepts, approaches and theories are also mostly used in the Ukrainian scientific sphere, which are adapted to Ukrainian realities and are proposed for implementation. There is a theoretical explanation of the concept of "sustainable development", there are conceptual approaches and there is a practical and political interpretation of this category. The article demonstrates the government's activities to create organizational and advisory structures responsible for sustainable development, on the examples of Ukraine and countries whose experience is implemented in Ukraine. The study showed a difference of views on the problems of building government organizational structures and advisory bodies on sustainable development in Ukraine and countries whose experience is implemented by Ukraine. There is a difference between the definitions of sustainable development in legislation and science of Ukraine. This leads to constant changes in the construction and liquidation of organizational structures and advisory bodies for sustainable development, and leads to instability of vectors of sustainable development, and a return to traditional and stereotypical management actions. Previous studies have not considered the government's efforts to establish organizational and advisory structures responsible for sustainable development in the organizational and legal context.

Key words: public administration, sustainable development, legal acts, e-government.

Проблема сталого розвитку останнім часом стала дуже популярною не лише в наукових дослідженнях, а й на практиці. Змінюються погляди, підходи та позиції. У політичній сфері держав з'являються нові документи щодо сталого розвитку та його досягнення. У наукових і політичних колах ведуться широкі дискусії щодо розуміння сталого розвитку та його концептуального обгрунтування. Надається статистика, створюються дорадчі органи з громадським представництвом, визначаються державні органи, відповідальні за сталий розвиток тощо. Звіти держав про таку діяльність представлені на міжнародних форумах для демонстрації найкращого досвіду. Безумовно, це питання є дискусійним. Україна впроваджує досвід зарубіжних країн. Фактично Україна виступає імпортером зарубіжного досвіду та намагається адаптувати його до вітчизняної соціокультурної традиції. На жаль, Україна не є експортером власного досвіду і не пропонує досягнень у сфері сталого розвитку іншим державам. Відповідно до цієї ситуації в українській науковій сфері також здебільшого використовуються зарубіжні концепції, підходи та теорії, які адаптовані до українських реалій і пропонуються для впровадження. Є теоретичне пояснення поняття 'сталий розвиток', є концептуальні підходи та є практичне та політичне тлумачення цієї категорії. Стаття демонструє діяльність уряду щодо створення організаційно-дорадчих структур, відповідальних за сталий розвиток, на прикладі України та країн, досвід яких впроваджується в Україні. Дослідження показало різницю поглядів на проблеми побудови державних організаційних структур та дорадчих органів зі сталого розвитку в Україні та країнах, досвід яких впроваджує Україна. Існує різниця між визначеннями сталого розвитку в законодавстві та науці України. Це призводить до постійних змін у побудові та ліквідації організаційних структур та дорадчих органів зі сталого розвитку, призводить до нестабільності векторів сталого розвитку, повернення до традиційних і стереотипних управлінських дій. Попередні дослідження не розглядали зусилля уряду щодо створення організаційних та дорадчих структур, відповідальних за сталий розвиток в організаційно-правовому контексті.

Ключові слова: публічне управління, сталий розвиток, нормативно-правові акти, електронне урядування.

Introduction

Changes in the views of scientists over the centuries on the essence of the concept of "sustainable development" have influenced global approaches to understanding the sustainability of states, their regions, as well as living and working conditions, quality of life, social security, development and of self-development, freedom and many other social and humanitarian aspects. The dynamics of scientific and practical approaches to understanding sustainable development demonstrates its focus on the socio-humanitarian spheres at the present stage. Issues of sustainable development concern many categories, in particular: scientists, managers, governments, enterprises, organizations, transnational institutions, civil society, et al. Modern scientific views are reflected in the voluntary reports of states on sustainable development, which were voiced at regional forums Modern scientific views are reflected in the voluntary reports of states on sustainable development, which were voiced at regional forums. Modern scientific views are reflected in the voluntary reports of states on sustainable development, which were voiced at regional forums.

The peculiarity of modern Ukrainian science and practice of public administration is the introduction of foreign experience in the practice of public administration. A large number of concepts of state development and the experience of many states are taken as a basis. However, the result of such implementation does not lead to the expected results. Scientists, politicians, public figures, etc. emphasize this. Scientists [1] ask the following questions: whether Ukraine will be able to achieve the goals of sustain-

able development at all; as the existence of sustainable development goals in strategic and program documents of Ukraine "does not guarantee that they will be fully implemented in Ukraine" [2]. Activities of governments to establish organizational and advisory structures for the regulation and management of sustainable development, and also its activities to sustainable development depends on several factors, in particular: of interpretation of the concept of "sustainable development"; of definition of basic concepts of sustainable development; of selection of key identifiers of sustainable development; of desire or motivation to form a system of sustainable development; of citizens' understanding of the meaning of sustainable development and their involvement in the management of sustainable development processes. We focused on the problems of the impact of the perception of the meaning of sustainable development, and the choice of the basic scientific concept of sustainable development on the government's activities to create organizational and managerial structures responsible for sustainable development.

Literature Review

In the legislation of Ukraine interpretations of sustainable development are used most often in the sense of the definitions given at UN conferences, in particular as: development of society to meet the needs of the current generation, taking into account the interests of future generations [3]; socially, economically and ecologically balanced development of urban and rural settlements, aimed at creating their economic potential, a full-fledged living environment for modern and future generations based on the rational use of resources (natural, labor, production, scientific and

technical, intellectual, etc.), technological re-equipment and restructuring of enterprises, improvement of social, production, transport, communication and information, engineering, ecological infrastructure, improving living conditions, recreation and health, preservation and enrichment of biological diversity and cultural heritage [4]. At the same time, there is no legal term "sustainable development" in the legislation of Ukraine. In addition, the interrelationships between the terms "sustainable growth" and "sustainable development" are not defined [5].

Understanding the sense of sustainable development in Ukrainian science and in the terms of the legislation of Ukraine has its differences. Sustainable development is considered in three legal acts of Ukraine with an interval of 16 years. Emphasis is placed on the economic, environmental, industrial, infrastructural, social and cultural spheres in the Resolution of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine 1999 (Document 1359-XIV). We are talking about creating the economic potential of urban and rural areas. Characterization of the notion "sustainable development" is done in accordance with the definitions adopted at international conferences. The vector of understanding the notion 'sustainable development' was changed after 16 years. In 2015 [6] it was understood as an introduction of European standards of life in Ukraine and Ukraine's entry into leading positions in the world and in fact concerns two areas: political and economic. Sustainable development is interpreted in terms of the Development Agenda after 2015 (Law of Ukraine, 2015. Document 156-VIII). Terminology of Ukrainian legislation distinguishes the concept of 'sustainable development of settlements' [7] in the context of the definition of Resolution of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine 1999 (Document 1359-XIV), and the term 'sustainable development' [8] in the context of the definition of the Law of Ukraine "On the principles of state regional policy" (Law of Ukraine, 2015, Document 156-VIII).

In fact, there is no identifier for the definitions of sustainable development given in legal acts, in particular scientific ones. The situation is similar with two documents on the state of sustainable development of Ukraine (Ukraine's National Baseline Report, 2017 [9], Ukraine's Voluntary National Review, 2020 [10]), which are not legal acts but are a reflection of the views of both academics and public administration actors. There is no definition of 'sustainable development' in these documents, too, and the sense of the notion is not singled out. However, there is a difference between the two documents.

The concept of sustainable development by Ukrainian scientists [11] has been analyzed as a

reflection and provision of solutions to the contradictions of society for a recent years. Researchers emphasize the existence of different approaches to interpreting the meaning of sustainable development. However, the definitions mostly used at the UN international conferences in 1987, 1992, 2000 and 2002 are used [11]. Some of the scientists' opinions were interesting for our study and we agree with them in particular regarding: of low level of implementation of the methodology of sustainable development in the field of public administration as well as the lack of strategic planning for the transition to sustainable development [12]; of lack in Ukraine of the concept of sustainable development and a comprehensive methodology for the formation, evaluation and control of sustainable development; of low level of sustainable development of Ukraine in comparison with many countries including the post-socialist space [13]; of development of the concept of 'sustainable development' and understanding its multifaceted meaning [14]. Researchers emphasize the concepts that are the basis of the concept of sustainable development, in particular: the concept of needs, economics, sustainable society. Scientific notions 'concept' and 'conceptual principles' are often replaced by the interpretation of terms which are used in the legal sphere of Ukraine and terminology of legislation, as well as in the practice of public administration of Ukraine.

The conceptual approach defined in the Voluntary National Reviews of the countries whose experience is implemented in Ukraine and is taken as a model is different. The main concept is partnership (France's and Germany's Voluntary National Reviews, 2016 [15; 16]; Denmark's, Netherlands's, Sweden's Voluntary National Reviews, 2017 [17–19]; Australia's, Canada's, Latvia's, Lithuania's, Poland's, Romania's, Switzerland's Voluntary National Reviews, 2018 [20–25]; United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland's Voluntary National Review, 2019 [26]; Bulgaria's, Estonia's Voluntary National Reviews, 2020 [27; 28]).

Methodology and research methods

The adopted methodology uses a qualitative approach. We used the method of direct comparison without defining a standard for its implementation, as there is no general scientific and political understanding of the meaning and contexts of the notion 'sustainable method' both in the world science and in Ukraine in particular. The lack of a common standard, the polysemy of the notion 'sustainable development' complicate the choice and formulation of the standard. The interpretation of the notion 'sustainable development' used in the Sustainable Development Goals 2030 was not taken as a basis, because it

defines the scope of the notion and is individual for different states and is used to determine indicators of sustainable development. Some key indicators which are problematic for understanding sustainable development in Ukraine and building a systematic work to achieve it, was taken for comparison. The identifier for comparison was the scientific concepts that characterize sustainable development.

The analysis was conducted at several levels: these are separate legal acts and Voluntary National Surveys of Ukraine Reviews wherein the concept of 'sustainable development' is defined and the organizational structures and advisory bodies responsible for sustainable development are approved; these are separate research in Ukrainian science of public administration in relation to the understanding of sustainable development; these are separate Voluntary National Reviews on Sustainable Development of States, the experience of which is being implemented in Ukraine. The identifier is the context of application of the concept of 'sustainable development' which influences the building of organizational governmental structures and advisory bodies, what are responsible for sustainable development. All this affects the choice of areas and vectors of sustainable development.

This made it possible to identify areas of sustainable development and its vectors outlined in the legal acts of Ukraine and demonstrate the basic scientific concepts of sustainable development that have formed the basis for the establishment of government organizational and advisory structures on sustainable development; to show the dynamics of the formation of vectors of sustainable development in Ukraine and their impact on changes in organizational and management structures responsible for sustainable development and communication with citizens in the context of sustainable development; to find out the main differences between the conceptual and managerial approaches of the governments of the states whose experience is introduced in Ukraine and the government of Ukraine, especially in the context of using e-government as a tool to involve citizens in sustainable development; to focus on cognitive dissonance as one of the indicators of sustainable development.

A comparison of Ukrainian views on building organizational structures for sustainable development and views in other countries, which are taken as a model in Ukraine, was conducted to identify differences and clarify their causes.

Findings

Analysis of the application of the concept of 'sustainable development' in the legal acts of Ukraine showed that:

- there is no single view and understanding of the sense and content of the notion 'sustainable development' in legal documents that regulate the scope of practical activities of public administration entities;
- understanding the notion 'sustainable development' in legal acts is even more limited than in Ukrainian scientific research;
- achievements of Ukrainian scientists are not used in characterizing sustainable development in legal documents and the definition of 'sustainable development' of international activities is repeated;
- the importance of the achievements of various branches of science for the practical activities of public administration is levelled.

Characteristics of the notion 'sustainable development' have been used in legal acts and are based on the concepts of the needs and a sustainable society. There is no clear understanding of the notion 'sustainable development'. The main importance of sustainable development is seen in ensuring and improving the monitoring of the achievement of sustainable development goals and improving Ukrainian statistics in 2017, and the importance of sustainable development is understood as bringing people's standards of life closer to the European average in 2020. Another area stands out, in addition to the traditional areas of sustainable development (economic, environmental and social) in 2020. This is effective management. This area has neither a definition nor a characteristics either. Thus, the lack of an identifier for the notion 'sustainable development' and lack of understanding of the sense of sustainable development and its content and significance can be traced in legal acts of Ukraine, as well as in the scientific area, too. Comparison of areas of sustainable development, which are specified in legal acts, and scientific concepts, which are used to characterize the notion 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science demonstrated the use of concepts of the needs and a sustainable society. We also distinguished the areas of sustainable development that are specified in the legal acts of Ukraine. These are economic, ecological, production, infrastructural, social, cultural, political, social spheres (Table 1).

Scientific and legal contexts of the notion 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science are considered from two positions, namely: in the context of interpretation of the concept in the legal documents of Ukraine 1999–2015 according to scientific conceptual views on sustainable development; and in the context of the National Report of Ukraine 2016 and the Voluntary Report of Ukraine 2020 in comparison with scientific conceptual glances on sustainable development (Table 2).

Table 1 The context of the application of the notion 'sustainable development' in the legal acts of Ukraine

| Document | The notion 'sustainable development' | Areas of sustainable development, highlighted in the legal acts of Ukraine | Concepts used to interpret the notion 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science |
|---|---|--|--|
| The term 'Sustainable development of | ecologically balanced development of urban and rural settlements, aimed at creating their economic potential, a full-fledged living environment for modern and future generations based on the rational use of resources (natural, labor, production, scientific and technical, intellectual, etc.), technological re-equipment and restructuring of enterprises, improvement of social, production, transport, communication and information, engineering, ecological infrastructure, improving living conditions, recreation and health, preservation and enrichment of biological diversity and cultural heritage' | economic sphere: development of territories | needs |
| (Laws term of Ukraine, 2021) | | environmental sphere: use of resources; improving living conditions | needs |
| = Resolution of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine 1999 (Document 1359-XIV) | | production sphere: re-equipment and restructuring of enterprises | needs |
| (Document 1339-XIV) | | infrastructural sphere: social, production, engineering, information and communication | needs |
| | | social sphere: improvement of social infrastructure; recreation; sanitation | needs |
| | | cultural sphere: preservation of cultural heritage | needs |
| Decree of the President of Ukraine 2015 (Document 5/2015) | 'This is the introduction of European living standards in Ukraine and Ukraine's entry into leading positions in the world' | political and economic spheres: introduction of European living standards | needs |
| The term 'Sustainable development' (Laws term of Ukraine, 2021) = Law of Ukraine 2015 (Document 156-VIII) | 'This is the development of society to meet the needs of the present generation, taking into account the interests of future generations' | social sphere: development of society | sustainable society |

Table 2 Context of usinotiong the 'sustainable development' in analytical international documents of Ukraine

| Document | The notion 'sustainable development' | Areas of sustainable development, highlighted in the legal acts of Ukraine | Concepts used to interpret the notion 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science |
|-------------------------|---|---|--|
| Ukraine's | There is no definition. The characteristic of the concept | economic | needs |
| National | concerns the following: integration of efforts to ensure | social | sustainable society |
| Baseline Report 2017 | , j | ecological | needs |
| Ukraine's | There is no definition. There is an goal to achieve the | economic | needs |
| Voluntary | Sustainable Development Goals, namely: bringing | social | needs |
| National Review 2020 | people's living standards closer to the European average. | ecological | needs |
| Keview 2020 | | effective management | _ |

Source: own elaboration authors

The comparison shows that, in fact, the concept of the needs and sustainable society is an identifier for defining the notion 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science and in legal acts, and international reports of Ukraine. Dissonance arises between attempts to combine the industrial model of sustainable development and a new paradigm of sustainable development concerning the willingness of the pop-

ulation to actively support a particular development strategy and take part in it, and be responsible for it what is often called 'social mobilization'. The lack of a clear conceptual framework for sustainable development is a consequence of such dissonance. It is reflected in Ukraine's National Baseline Report 2017 and Ukraine's Voluntary National Review 2020. Analysis of the Voluntary National Review on Achieving

the Sustainable Development Goals of different states and Ukraine demonstrated a decrease of the level of activity in this direction in Ukraine. Thus, the Voluntary National Report on Sustainable Development in Ukraine was developed in 2017 (Sustainable Development Goals: Ukraine, 2017). Promising actions of Ukraine for 15 years to achieve sustainable development have been revealed on 176 pages. 17 working subgroups were involved to define goals (where each group was responsible for each goal), and 32 round tables were held, and more than 800 specialists in the areas corresponding to thematic spheres of sustainable development goals were involved, namely: government officials, managers, UN staff, diplomats, scientists, economists, demographers, health workers, epidemiologists, environmentalists, educators, journalists, entrepreneurs, NGO leaders and other civil society representatives. The population survey was conducted and the main goals for Ukraine were identified at that time. Finally, The Generalized National Review of Ukraine has been presented on 2 pages in three years in 2020. Commitment to Sustainable Development Goals was confirmed in this document and the theses of the previous report were repeated (Ukraine's Voluntary National Review, 2020).

The analysis of legal acts of Ukraine and analytical reports showed the following vectors: it is a vector of development of society in 1997; it is a vector of development, security, responsibility, pride in 2015; it is a vector of economic, social, environmental, development of national statistics in 2017; it is a vector of economy, civil society, state in 2019; it is a vector of organizational and managerial, business, environmental, social in 2020. The same applies to the creation of organizational and managerial structures responsible for sustainable development, in particular: the National Commission for Sustainable Development of Ukraine under the Cabinet of Ministers was established (without public involvement) in 1997; this commission was liquidated in 2003; responsibilities are shared between ministries in 2015; the responsibility shifted to the government and stakeholders in 2019; the Interdepartmental Working Group was established (without involvement of broad public and scientifics) in 2020. (Table 3).

Existence of a paradigm of sustainable development in the states (Australia, Bulgaria, Canada, Denmark, Estonia, France, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, Netherlands, Poland, Romania, Sweden, Switzerland, and United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland), whose experience is introduced in Ukraine or which are recognized as a model, demonstrates the existence of a systematic approach to the creation of appropriate organizational and advisory structures.

The comparison was made on the basis of Voluntary National Reviews of states and Ukraine, and demonstrated the deepening dissonance in the understanding of the notion 'sustainable development' in public administration which affects the development of a nationwide approach and public awareness in this regard. Partnership paradigm, which is present in all researched Voluntary Reviews of the states, is reflected in the organizational and managerial approach to the development of sustainable development. The main emphasis is on the formation of advisory bodies and involving general population and building cooperation with all sectors. Lack of a paradigm of sustainable development in Ukraine and underestimating the importance of research and opportunities for their implementation in the practice of public administration led to the situation that the experience of states in terms of the division of responsibilities for sustainable development between ministries was taken as basis. The experience of states in establishing advisory bodies was transferred in Ukraine to the framework of the European Commission's 'European Green Agreement' initiative. The implementation of this initiative involved the establishment of a specific Interagency Working Group to overcome the effects of climate change. The government has assigned the responsibility for sustainable development on this working group too. Obviously, sustainable development is understood in the context of overcoming the effects of climate change. This is another area of sustainable development for Ukraine which is specified in Ukraine's Voluntary National Review (2020). There is not taken into account that other states take the partnership paradigm as a basis to describe and characterize the concept of 'sustainable development', which is absent in Ukrainian science and practice of public administration (Table 4).

Lack of partnership paradigm in the aspect of sustainable development and understanding it as a conceptual basis for sustainable development was due to the unrecognized of the role of communication in public administration on sustainable development, with involvement of the population in these processes. The analysis showed that the relevant central authorities in Ukraine do not provide an adequate response to the prevention of threats in the implementation of e-government during the formation and implementation of state policy to achieve sustainable development. First of all, it concerns the provision of electronic services to vulnerable groups and reducing the digital gap through Internet access, the cost of mobile devices and Internet use, strategies for the development of smart-cities in Ukraine, and treating them as a necessary component of achieving

Table 3

Dynamics of formation of organizational and managerial structures of public administration responsible for sustainable development in Ukraine

| 1 CS | UKraine | |
|--|---|---|
| Legal acts of Ukraine on sustainable development | Organizational and managerial structures for sustainable development | Vectors of development defined in the legal acts of Ukraine on sustainable development |
| "On the National Commission for Sustainable Development of Ukraine under the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine". (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 1997. Document 1491-97-Π) [29] | The National Commission for Sustainable Development of Ukraine under the Cabinet of Ministers was established (The Ministry of Environmental Protection and Nuclear Safety was responsible for organizing the activities, and the National Academy of Sciences was responsible for scientific and methodological support) | Vector of development: for a society that depends on economic, social and environmental factors |
| "On the liquidation of the National Commission for Sustainable Development of Ukraine under the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine" (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2003. Document 1414-2003-п) [30] | The National Commission for Sustainable Development of Ukraine under the Cabinet of Ministers was liquidated. | |
| "On Sustainable Development Strategy "Ukraine – 2020". (Decree of the President of Ukraine, 2015. Document 5/2015) | Organizational support for the implementation of the Strategy should be carried out by developing and adopting in the prescribed manner the relevant regulations, annual action plans for the implementation of this Strategy, monitoring the status of their implementation. Social contract is considered important between government, business and civil society, where each party has its own area of responsibility. | Vectors of development: development, security, responsibility, pride. |
| "About the Goals of sustainable development of Ukraine for the period up to 2030" (Decree of the President of Ukraine, 2019. Document 722/2019) [31] | Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine + scientists + experts + representatives of public associations = analysis of forecast and program documents taking into account the Sustainable Development Goals of Ukraine for the period up to 2030 = introduction of an effective system of monitoring the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals of Ukraine for the period up to 2030 and publication of its results annually. The goals of sustainable development of Ukraine for the period up to 2030 are recommended to be taken into account by the Academies of Sciences of Ukraine when determining the directions of scientific research. | Vectors of development: economy, civil society, state. |
| "On the establishment of an interagency working group on coordination of climate change in the framework of the European Commission's initiative "European Green Agreement" (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2020. Document 33-2020-n) [32] | Interdepartmental Working Group on Climate Change Coordination in the framework of the European Commission's European Green Agreement initiative. | Vectors of development: organizational and managerial (ensuring coordinated actions of central and local executive bodies); businesses (creating conditions to ensure the competitiveness of Ukrainian producers and enterprises); ecological (preserving bio-diversity); social (protection of health and well-being of citizens, dependence on risks and consequences of climate change). |
| Ukraine's National Baseline Report and Ukraine's Voluntary National Review | Organizational and managerial structures for sustainable development | Vectors of development defined in the legal acts of Ukraine on sustainable development |
| Ukraine's National Baseline Report 2017 | Ministry of Economic Development and Trade+involvement of stakeholders (ministries, NGOs, scientists, experts, international organizations) with the support of all UN agencies in Ukraine to prepare a report. | Vectors of development: measuring social progress in general; improving the system of national statistics; economic, social, environmental vectors; effective management. |
| Ukraine's Voluntary National Review 2020 | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) + Interdepartmental group + assignments to National Academies of Sciences. | Vectors of development: ecological; effective management. |

Table 4 Conceptual views on sustainable development and their reflection in organizational and managerial structures of public administration

| and managerial structures of public administration | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|
| Voluntary National Review of States | Scientific concepts of sustainable development (from Table 5) | Organizational and managerial structures responsible for sustainable development in the states | Scientific concepts of sustainable development from the documents of Ukraine | Organizational and managerial structures responsible for sustainable development in Ukraine | |
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | |
| Ukraine's National Baseline Report 2017 | | | - | Ministry of Economic Development and Trade + involvement of stakeholders (ministries, NGOs, scientists, experts, international organizations) with the support of all UN agencies in Ukraine to prepare the report | |
| Ukraine's Voluntary National Review 2020 | | | _ | Interdepartmental Working Group on Climate Change Coordination in the framework of the European Commission's European Green Agreement initiative | |
| Australia's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships | Government (coordination and cooperation; division of responsibilities between agencies) + universities + enterprises + civil society + individual citizens | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) + Interdepartmental group | |
| Bulgaria's Voluntary National Review 2020 | Partnerships (in terms of active participation); (no direct link, manual sample from the text) | Government + youth + NGO + private sector + academia + local level + vulnerable segments of the population + every citizen (through online consultations on the government portal) | _ | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) | |
| Canada's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships (a new type of partnership is being formed) | Government + private sector + civil society + Sustainable Development Group (coordination between federal agencies and institutions and stakeholders) + indigenous peoples | _ | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) | |
| Denmark's Voluntary National Review 2017 | Partnerships | Government + civil society + municipalities + business + various stakeholders + academia | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries)+ instruction to academia | |
| Estonia's Voluntary National Review 2020 | Partnerships | Government + Interdepartmental Working Group on Sustainable Development + Commission on Sustainable Development + several NGOs + business | _ | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries)+ Interdepartmental group | |
| France's Voluntary National Review 2016 | Partnerships | Interministerial Representative for Sustainable Development + Commissioner-General for Sustainable Development + Government + profile Committees + civil society + private sector + the general public (through an online platform for dissemination of best practices, recommendations, monitoring) | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) | |

Table 4 (Continued)

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|---|--|---|--|
| Germany's Voluntary National Review 2016 | Partnerships and responsibilities | Committee of State Secretaries for Sustainable Development (representatives of all federal ministries)+ Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development + Sustainable Development Council (independent advisory council to assess the federal government's impact on sustainability)+ Federal Chancellery + all ministries | _ | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |
| Latvia's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Sustainable development of human capital (no direct link, manual sampling from the text) | National Development Council + line ministries + stakeholders | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |
| Lithuania's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships | A group of experts, which is attended by representatives of various ministries + NGOs + municipalities | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |
| Netherlands's Voluntary National Review 2017 | Partnerships | National and local governments + relevant ministries + Sustainable Development Working Group + all relevant participants + private campaigns (including the financial sector) + NGOs + educational institutions + youth organizations + trade unions | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |
| Poland's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships and participation | Government + stakeholders through partnership and involvement | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |
| Romania's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships; The concept of sustainable development, developed by Romanian scientists Nicolae Georgescu- Roegen 1971 | Interdepartmental Committee on Sustainable Development + Subcommittee on Sustainable Development + Department for Sustainable Development under the Prime Minister's Office + civil society + scientific circles | _ | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries)+ Interdepartmental group |
| Sweden's Voluntary National Review 2017 | Partnerships and interaction | Committee to support the implementation of the 2030 Agenda at the national and international levels + all ministries + municipalities + social partners + business sector + civil society + research community | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries)+ Interdepartmental group |
| Switzerland's Voluntary National Review 2018 | Partnerships | Federal Council + cantons + communities (strengthening cooperation through the creation of special Internet platforms)+ private sector + NGO + community + Non- Governmental Advisory Group | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries)+ Interdepartmental group |
| United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland's Voluntary National Review 2019 | Partnerships and needs; changes in views on development, which relate to both concepts and actions | Government + civil society + private sector | - | Government (division of responsibilities between ministries) |

sustainable development at the local level. In addition, the responsibility for providing an appropriate response to electronic petitions, which received the required number of votes, is absent despite such an existing tool of e-democracy as the e-petition. This is especially true at the national level. It can also be

stated that there is a disagreement between the central authorities in Ukraine who are responsible for sustainable development, and e-government authorities. Thus, e-government is not seen as a necessary component of achieving the goals of sustainable development. (Table 5).

Table 5 Consideration of current implementation trends of e-government in Ukraine in the context of achieving the goals of sustainable development and preventing threats along the way

| Current trends in the introduction of e-government | Threats to achieving the goals of sustainable development in Ukraine | Institutions responsible for avoiding threats and risks in the implementation of e-government in Ukraine | Regulatory and legal regulation | Proposed solutions to problems |
|---|--|--|--|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Electronic services | Lack of access to the Internet and mobile devices; misuse of personal data; lack of uniform requirements for the introduction of electronic services; unresolved issues of electronic identification and authentication; lack of interdepartmental electronic interaction; the complexity of providing e-services | Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine | "About administrative services" (Law of Ukraine, 2013) [33]; "On Electronic Trust Services" (Law of Ukraine, 2017) [34]; "The Concept of Development of the e-Services System in Ukraine" (Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2016) [35]; "The Concept of Development of E-Government in Ukraine" (Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2017) [36] | The only portal of state administrative services of Ukraine; Government services online |
| Electronic services for vulnerable groups | Lack of Internet access; the difficulty in obtaining electronic services; the cost of using the Internet and mobile devices. | Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine, Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine, Pension Fund of Ukraine, | "About administrative services" (Law of Ukraine, 2013) | Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine; Electronic Services Portal Pension Fund of Ukraine |
| Bridging the digital gap | Lack of Internet access; inequality in education, income levels, ethnicity and race, gender, culture, age; the presence of digital inequality due to insufficiently developed Internet access infrastructure depending on the geographical location and types of settlements | Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine, National commission for the state regulation of communications and informatization | Digital Agenda of Ukraine, 2020 (project) [37] | Digital education. National Digital Literacy Campaign |
| Prevention of cyber threats | The growing number of hacker attacks; mass distribution of malware; insecurity of personal data | Central and regional situational centres for cyber security CBY, National Cybersecurity Coordination Center at the National Security and Defence Council, State Service of special communication and information protection of Ukraine | "Regulations of the National Cybersecurity Coordination Center" (Decree of the President of Ukraine, 2016) [38]; "Regulations of Administration of State Service of special communication and information protection of Ukraine 2020" (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2018) [39], "On Protection of Personal Data" (The Law of Ukraine, 2020) [40] | "On the decision of the National Security and Defense Council of Ukraine of May 6, 2015 'On the National Security Strategy of Ukraine' (Decree of the President of Ukraine, 2015) |

Table 5 (Continued)

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|---|--|--|--|---|
| Open data | Insufficient legal regulation of data collection, use and storage; data management and protection; identification and privacy management; and cybersecurity. | Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine | "About approval of the Regulations on data sets which are subject to promulgation in the form of open data" (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2015) [41]; "On Access to Public Information" (Law of Ukraine, 2011) [42] | Unified State Web portal Open Data |
| Electronic participation and effective communications | Low level of citizen involvement; lack of sufficient motivation; low availability of e-democracy tools for vulnerable groups; lack of knowledge and skills of civil servants and officials of local governments, and citizens on the use of e-democracy tools. | Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine, Official Internet Representation of the President of Ukraine, Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, City Councils | "On Access to Public Information" (Law of Ukraine, 2011); "On Citizens' Appeals" (Law of Ukraine, 1996. Revision on January 1, 2020) [43]; "On approval of the Concept for the development of e-democracy in Ukraine and the action plan for its implementation" (Order of Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2017) [44] | Electronic Petition Official Internet Representation of the President of Ukraine; Electronic petitions of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine; Electronic petitions of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine; Electronic petitions of the Kyiv City Council |
| Smart-cities | Lack of coordination at the national, regional and local levels; lack of a National Strategy for the Development of Smart Cities; misunderstanding of the importance of data anonymization | City Councils, Ministry of Energy and Environmental Protection of Ukraine | Digital Agenda of Ukraine 2020 (Project); "On approval of the Concept of development of the digital economy and society of Ukraine for 2018–2020 and approval of the action plan for its implementation" (Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2018) [45]; "On approval of the Concept of creation of the national automated system" Open environment (Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2018) [46] | Kyiv Smart City initiative, The Open City project, Rosumne Misto. All-Ukrainian platform for electronic debugging and democracy |

The analysis also showed another context of cognitive dissonance, namely effective implementation of e-government as a modern communicative part, which contributes to the goals of sustainable development: providing quality available electronic services; reducing the digital and taking into account the needs of the most vulnerable; active involvement of citizens in the process of making and taking managerial decisions; development of smart-cities and application of smart solutions to solve environmental problems, energy efficiency, mobility, resource savings; avoiding cyber threats and misuse of personal data.

Conclusion

The study showed that the lack of a common view and understanding of the meaning of 'sustainable development' in the legal acts of Ukraine, which regulate the sphere of practical activity of subjects of public administration leads to constant change of

vectors of sustainable development since 1997. This, in turn, causes constant changes in the creation and elimination of organizational structures and advisory bodies responsible for sustainable development. The partnership paradigm has not become the basis for the formation of the concept and system of sustainable development in Ukraine, in contrast to the practice of countries whose experience is being implemented in Ukraine. In addition, it is not used as a basis for the scientific characterization of the concept of 'sustainable development' in the Ukrainian science of public administration. This is reflected in the government's organizational and management approach to sustainable development, and in communication with citizens on sustainable development using e-government capabilities.

In our opinion, the primary source of sustainable development problems in Ukraine is to understand the

concept of 'sustainable development' which depends on the existing paradigm, the translation of terms into Ukrainian from English and communication between all public authorities and society through modern e-government capabilities. Making important decisions and the process of forming sustainable development in the context of the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals depends on understanding the meanings of concepts and categories used by scientists and politicians. It is the understanding of meanings and meanings that answers the question: what is it for and what does it give.

Acceptance of new meanings, formation of new types of partnerships, which are demonstrated in many states, are transformed of in the Ukrainian realities because public officials, the public and businesses do not have an awareness of sustainable development. Acceptance of the mission and importance of sustainable development in terms of improving Ukrainian national statistics and monitoring of sustainable development has led to level this notion for the subjects of public administration and for society

as a whole. A clear example of the lack of a systematic approach is the constant changes in the vectors of sustainable development in the state, which are confirmed by legal acts. The desire to make changes, to introduce best practices leads to a dissonance in the understanding of the mission, values, significance of sustainable development and the achievement of the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals.

Notion of 'sustainable development' in Ukrainian science and practice of public administration requires rethinking its meaning, significance and context. In fact, the paradigm of sustainable development is changing as in the development of the system of concepts by which it is characterized, and in the establishment of identifiers. Accordingly, the contextual meanings of scientific concepts and terms which move from the old system of definitions to the new as well as the context of application of these concepts in the practice of public administration(in the sense of the environment or sphere to which this notion is applied; for what or for what it is used) have important significant.

REFERENCES:

- 1. Гороховець Є.В., Жаліло Я.А., Ковалівська С.В., Максюта А.А. та ін. Аналіз державних стратегічних документів України щодо врахування адаптованих для України Цілей Сталого Розвитку до 2030 року. Аналітична доповідь. Київ : Інститут суспільно- економічних досліджень, 2017. 84 с.
- 2. Аналіз державних стратегічних документів щодо врахування адаптованих для України Цілей Сталого Розвитку до 2030 року. Аналітична доповідь. Київ : Інститут суспільно-економічних досліджень, 2017. 84 с.
- 3. Про засади державної регіональної політики : Закон України від 05.02.2015. № 156-VIII, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/156-19/ed20150205#n30 (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 4. Про концепцію сталого розвитку населених пунктів : Постанова Верховної Ради України від 24.12.1999. № 1359-XIV, поточна редакція. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1359-14/ed19991224/find?text=%D1%F2 %E0%E8%E9+%F0%EE%E7%E2%E8%F2%EE%EA+%ED%E0%F1%E5%EB%E5%ED%E8%F5+%EF%F3% ED%EA%F2%B3%E2#Text (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 5. Про схвалення Концепції реалізації державної політики у сфері сприяння розвиту соціально відповідального бізнесу в Україні на період до 2030 року : Розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 24 січня 2020 р. № 66-р, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/66-2020-%D1%80#Text (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 6. Про Стратегію сталого розвитку «Україна 2020» : Указ Президента України від 12.01.2015 № 5/2015, поточна редакція. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/5/2015#Text (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 7. Сталий розвиток населених пунктів ; Термінологія законодавства. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/term/28587 (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 8. Сталий розвиток; Термінологія законодавства.; Термінологія законодавства. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/term/33999 (дата звернення: 3.02.2021).
- 9. Ukraine's National Baseline Report. Sustainable Development Goals: Ukraine. Paper presented of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine at the press conference of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. 15 September 2017. Kyiv. URL: https://www.ua.undp.org/content/ukraine/en/home/library/sustainable-development-report/sustainable-development-goals--2017-basseline-national-report.html (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 10. Ukraine's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented at the Regional Forum on sustainable for the unece region. 19 March 2020. Geneva. URL: https://www.unece.org/rfsd.html (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 11. Смирнова І.І., Михайлюта Є.І. Сталий розвитку в Україні: теоретичні аспекти. *Економічний вісник Донбасу*. 2018. № 1(51). С. 10–14.
- 12. Молоканова В.М. Моніторинг практичної реалізації стратегії сталого розвитку в Україні. *Аспекти публічного управління*. 2018. Т. 6. № 11-12. С. 85–92.
- 13. Лазарєва О.В., Рощенко В.А. Розвиток екологічної складової сталого розвитку економіки України. *Інвестиції: практика та досвід.* 2019. № 8. С. 19–22.

- 14. Кравченко Ю.М., Антощенкова В.В. Фактори сталого розвитку економіки аграрного сектору. *Вісник Харківського національного технічного університету сільського господарства імені Петра Василенка*. 2019. Вип. 200 «Економічні науки». С. 174–183.
- 15. France's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum on Sustainable Development 2016 Ensuring that no one is left behind. 11-20 July 2016. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/france (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 16. Germany's Voluntary National Review 2016. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum on Sustainable Development 2016 Ensuring that no one is left behind, 11-20 July 2016. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment. un.org/memberstates/germany (дата звернення: 15.02 2021).
- 17. Denmark's Voluntary National Review 2017. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum, 10-19 July 2017, New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=30022&nr=378&menu=3170 (дата звернення: 15.02 2021).
- 18. Netherlands's Voluntary National Review 2017. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum, 10-19 July 2017. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/netherlands (дата звернення: 15.02 2021).
- 19. Sweden's Voluntary National Review 2017. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum, 10-19 July 2017. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/sweden (дата звернення: 15.02 2021).
- 20. Australia's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/australia (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 20. Canada's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=30022&nr=1049&menu=3170 (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 21. Latvia's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/latvia (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 22. Lithuania's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/lithuania (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 23. *Poland*'s Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=30022&nr=804&menu=3170 (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 24. Romania's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/romania (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 25. Switzerland's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented of the High-level Political Forum. 9-18 July 2018. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/memberstates/switzerland (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 26. United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland's Voluntary National Review. Paper presented for the Highlevel Political Forum under the auspices of ECOSOC. 9-18 July 2019. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment. un.org/memberstates/unitedkingdom (дата звернення: 12.02.2021).
- 27. Bulgaria's Voluntary National Review 2020. Paper presented for the High-level Political Forum under the auspices of ECOSOC. 7-16 July 2020. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=3002 2&nr=2052&menu=3170 (дата звернення: 15.02.2021).
- 28. Estonia's Voluntary National Review 2020. Paper presented for the High-level Political Forum under the auspices of ECOSOC. 7-16 July 2020. New York. URL: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=3002 2&nr=68&menu=3170 (дата звернення: 15.02.2021).
- 29. Про національну комісію сталого розвитку України при Кабінеті Міністрів України : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 30 грудня 1997 р. № 1491(постанова втратила чинність на підставі Постанови КМУ від 04.09.2003 № 1414). URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1491-97-%D0%BF#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 30. Про ліквідацію Національної комісії сталого розвитку України при Кабінеті Міністрів України : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 4 вересня 2003 р. № 1414, поточна редакція. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1414-2003-%D0%BF#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 31. Про цілі сталого розвитку України на період до 2030 року : Указ Президента України № 722/2019, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/722/2019#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 32. Про утворення міжвідомчої робочої групи з питань координації подолання наслідків зміни клімату в рамках ініціативи Європейської Комісії «Європейський зелений курс» : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 24 січня 2020 р. № 33, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/33-2020-%D0%BF#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 33. Про адміністративні послуги : Закон України від 06.07.2013. № 5203-VI, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada. gov.ua/laws/show/5203-17#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 34. Про електронні довірчі послуги : Закон України зі змінами від 14.01.2020. № 440-IX, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2155-19#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).

- 35. Про схвалення Концепції розвитку системи електронних послуг в Україні : Розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 16 листопада 2016 р. № 918-р, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/918-2016-%D1%80#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 36. Про схвалення Концепції розвитку електронного урядування в Україні : Розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 20 вересня 2017 р. № 649-р., чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/649-2017-%D1%80#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 37. Проект Закону України «Про цифровий порядок денний України». 2020 р. URL: https://www.rada.gov.ua/uploads/documents/40009.pdf (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 38. Про національний координаційний центр кібербезпеки : Указ Президента України від 7 червня 2016 року № 242, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/242/2016?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 39. Про затвердження Положення про Адміністрацію Державної служби спеціального зв'язку та захисту інформації України : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 3 вересня 2014 р. № 411, чинна. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/411-2014-%D0%BF?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 40. Про захист персональних даних : Закон України зі змінами від 16.12.2020 № 1089-IX, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2297-17?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 41. Про затвердження Положення про набори даних, які підлягають оприлюдненню у формі відкритих даних : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 21 жовтня 2015 р. № 835, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/835-2015-%D0%BF?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 42. Про доступ до публічної інформації : Закон України від 13.01.2011. № 2939-VI, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/%D0%B4%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82%D1%83%D0%BF_%D0%B4%D0%BE_%D0%BF%D 1%83%D0%B1%D0%BB%D1%96%D1%87%D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%97_%D1%96%D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%80%D0%BC%D0%BD%D1%86%D1%96%D1%97#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 43. Про звернення громадян : Закон України від 02.10.96. № 394, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/393/96-%D0%B2%D1%80?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 44. Про схвалення Концепції розвитку електронної демократії в Україні та плану заходів щодо її реалізації : Розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 8 листопада 2017 р. № 797-р, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov. ua/laws/show/797-2017-%D1%80?lang=en#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 45. Про схвалення Концепції розвитку цифрової економіки та суспільства України на 2018–2020 роки та затвердження плану заходів щодо її реалізації : Постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 17 січня 2018 р. № 67-р, чинний. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/67-2018-%D1%80#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).
- 46. Про схвалення Концепції створення загальнодержавної автоматизованої системи «Відкрите довкілля» : Розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 7 листопада 2018 р. № 835-р. URL: https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/825-2018-%D1%80#Text (дата звернення: 7.02.2021).