

УДК 94(477.85):323.1:136.647.5

В. Богатырец
(Черновцы)© Valentyna Bohatyrets
(Chernivtsi)**TOLERANCE IN A MULTICULTURAL
COMMUNITY: A GUIDE TO DEVELOPING
AND SUSTAINING DIALOGUE**

Tolerance has been recognized today as crucial characteristic in pluralist, multicultural communities which are seeking to be free of oppression, violence and discrimination. The lack of tolerance is almost always the starting point for armed conflicts. In this context, in times of glocalization the importance of tolerance becomes ever more imperative. Tolerance is considered to be a solution to address injustice, unfairness, inequality and prejudice. Tolerance is essential for democracy and civilized life and its absence brings crimes and terrorism to society. The multi-national community of Bukovyna and Chernivtsi itself remains rather topical in terms of our study and serves as a thriving model of a community with 'marble cake' identity, well grounded in a culture of tolerance, benevolence and mutual respect.

Key terms: tolerance, multicultural communities, glocalization, ethnic, cultural and religious diversity, Ukraine, Chernivtsi, national reconciliation.

В. Богатырец
(Чернівці)**ТОЛЕРАНТНІСТЬ У МУЛЬТИКУЛЬТУР-
НОМУ СУСПІЛЬСТВІ ЯК НЕОБХІДНА
УМОВА СТАЛОГО РОЗВИТКУ
ТА КОНСТРУКТИВНОГО ДІАЛОГУ**

Нині толерантність апіорі повинна бути най-суттєвішою характерною рисою плюралістичних, мультикультурних спільнот, які прагнуть бути вільними від будь-якого утиску, насильства і дискримінації. Відсутність толерантності майже завжди призводить до збройних конфліктів. Разом з тим, концепт толерантності виступає важливим конструктом глокалізації. Толерантність є досить суттєвою умовою сталого розвитку демократії та цивілізованого життя, а її відсутність призводить до злочинності та тероризму у світі. Багатокультурна громада Буковини і, власне Чернівців, служить моделлю спільноти з ідентичністю «мармурового кексу», заснованої на терпимості, доброзичливості та взаємоповазі і залишається досить актуальною в контексті нашого дослідження.

Ключові слова: толерантність, мультикультурні спільноти, глокалізація, етнічне, культурне та релігійне розмаїття, Україна, Чернівці, національне примирення.

**ТОЛЕРАНТНОСТЬ В МУЛЬТИКУЛЬТУР-
НОМ ОБЩЕСТВЕ КАК НЕОБХОДИМОЕ
УСЛОВИЕ УСТОЙЧИВОГО РАЗВИТИЯ
И КОНСТРУКТИВНОГО ДИАЛОГА**

На сегодняшний день толерантность априори должна быть существенной характерной чертой плюралистических, мультикультурных обществ, которые стремятся быть свободными от любого притеснения, насилия и дискриминации. Отсутствие толерантности почти всегда приводит к вооруженным конфликтам. Вместе с тем, концепт толерантности выступает важным конструктом глокализации. Толерантность является достаточно существенным условием стабильного развития демократии и цивилизованной жизни, а ее отсутствие приводит к преступности и терроризма в мире. Многокультурное общество Буковины и, собственно Черновцов, служит моделью сообщества с идентичностью «мраморного кекса», основанной на терпимости, доброжелательности и взаимоуважении и остается весьма актуальной в контексте нашего исследования.

Ключевые слова: толерантность, мультикультурные общества, глокализация, этническое, культурное и религиозное разнообразие, Украина, Черновцы, национальное примирение.

November 16th is annually observed as the United Nations' *International Day for Tolerance* in recognition of the Paris Declaration, which was signed that day in 1995 by 185 member states. In 1996 the UN General Assembly invited member states to observe the International Day for Tolerance, with activities directed towards both educational establishments and the wider public (resolution 51/95 of 12 December). This memorable day came in the wake of the United Nations Year for Tolerance, 1995, proclaimed by the assembly in 1993 (resolution 48/126). The year was declared on the General Conference of UNESCO's initiative. On November 16, 1995, the UNESCO member states adopted the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance and Follow-up Plan of Action for the year.

In the present-day world, ethnic, cultural and religious diversity is indispensable construct of the 21st century reality. All over the globe, intergroup tensions, religious hostilities and ethnic conflict have increased and these conflicts alongside with problems of poverty that have accelerated migration, resulted in increasing number of refugees in countries that used to be mono-cultural. Multiculturalism is a social condition that is much visible in every walk of life these days. Cultural diversity can be an excellent opportunity to educate young

generation for harmony of cultures which is perceived as culture of tolerance and peace.

Dealing with cultural diversity has not always implied shaping and developing attitudes of tolerance, respect and understanding towards others. As long as traditions and practices of intolerance and social exclusion are not counteracted on a global level, social cohesion in society is endangered. It has also become clear that religion is an influential resource in people's lives and is seen to shape the actions of groups in society. The United Nations has emphasized on significance of dialogue based on principles of tolerance and dignity.¹

It should be stressed, that human communities have a natural tendency to define their identities by distinguishing themselves from others. This can have positive outcomes such as respect for diversity as well as negative consequences such as hostility or abhorrence because of one group's seeing its' superiority and pre-eminence. Actually, history has shown that no group, religion, ideology or culture has a monopoly of truth, beauty and good; there is not a better or true culture, but there are thousands of them. In our era of *glocalization*, «we can affirm that the globalized approach with its international legal protection of cultural heritage is contributing positively to advancing the knowledge and appreciation of the various cultures of humanity, but it is not leading to any kind of standardization or uniformity nor any hegemony of one culture over another»².

There are no better nations or ethnic groups, but there are many diverse nations and ethnic groups in the world. Despite that, looking at different cultures, it can be said that they share many common grounds and values, tolerance is one of them and underlies in the appreciation of diversity and the ability to live and let others live. It is the ability to exercise a fair and objective attitude towards those whose opinions, practices, religion, nationality differ from one's own. Tolerance is often defined as the ability to accept the values and beliefs of others that poses dilemma, but how is it possible to ask people to accept all other peoples' values and practices when they might believe that some of those ideas and behavior are wrong? ...Tolerance is a controversial topic by way of being debated throughout the history as corruptive and constructive at the same time. Tolerance is said to be indispensable for any decent society. It has been recognized today as crucial characteristic in pluralist, multicultural communities which are seeking to be free of oppression, violence and discrimination.³

According to MEP Eugen Freund, tolerance is «the core issue» of our society. «In particular the

conflicts of the present – in the Middle East, but also in the *Ukraine* – clearly show that the lack of tolerance is almost always the starting point for armed conflicts. In this context, in times of globalization and individualization the importance of tolerance will become ever more important. Without accepting or even tolerating conflicting beliefs the concept of Western democracy cannot function».⁴

It is of paramount importance that Ukraine as a distinctive multi-lingual nation-state with poly-ethnic makeup, poly-mentality, multiculturalism and multi-confessionalism serves as a cross-border locally and as a communicative subsystem globally. Currently Ukraine is in its right way of developing internal discourse for vigorous inter-ethnic communication for national unity, and yielding its own values.

In terms of treating information as a gage of Liberty and democracy, equally alarming is the ambiguous nature of different political, media and think-tank coverage on the internationalization of the struggle inside Ukraine that turned it into a geopolitical tug of war. These changes are reshaping the international landscape. The Ukraine crisis is accelerating power shifts. Russia is considered to be a net geopolitical «loser»; sagging UN emerges stronger; NATO boosts its defenses; and China opens new doors.

To the point, the European Union has considered the importance of Ukraine as an integral part of common European space and elaborated special instruments for development the mutually beneficial relations. The EU and Ukraine have signed bilateral agreements; Ukraine has joined different European programs of assistance and cooperation. The main goals of this wide range of documents are to stimulate internal transformation of Ukraine as well as to comply with Ukraine's political, economic and social system with the European one. From its side, Kyiv has articulated the vital significance to build close relationship with Europe and its political will and determination to put reforms into effect aiming to integrate to the EU in ten-fifteen years. It is worth mentioning that Ukrainian case is a challenge to the EU and its status as one of the world power.

Furthermore, the EU and Ukraine still share borders and are immediate neighbors, recognizing their political and economic interdependence. So, there is a necessity to work together within Ukraine-EU dialogue for creating the area of stability, peace and tolerance, sustainable development and overwhelming social and economic progress on the EU external borders.

Cultural and religious diversity has long been a matter of lived reality in the world. In many conflict

situations where religion is often manipulated or exploited, identity is enhanced to sustain the unity of the group which is often used to justify hostility and violence. It is widely believed that people's identity stay forever because of the fact that they are born in a given country. However, identity of a group or individual is not unchangeable; formation of identity is a process of adopting norms which we consider important⁵. It should be emphasized that the ignorance of regional, religious and cultural diversity in Ukraine gave the rise to political cleavage and direct warfare. The separatists fighting the Western-leaning government in Kiev subscribe to an ideology that includes a strict adherence to the conservative Russian Orthodox faith. In rebel leaders' speeches and propaganda, the Russian Orthodox Church is presented as an inherent part of the culture and history of the Donbass. It is one of the driving forces behind the rebels' greater ambition of building Novorossiya, or New Russia, a territory that includes all of southeastern Ukraine. Religion in eastern Ukraine's nearly yearlong conflict has played such a dominant role in the propaganda that there is a rebel battalion called the Russian Orthodox Army. Russian Cossacks at checkpoints across the region say they are God's defenders of the Russian people and proudly show the crosses around their necks and copies of gilded icons in their pockets. Thousands of Jews, Muslims and other religious minorities have fled rebel-controlled territories out of fear of the fighting and persecution. Many churches, including the Church of Christ, have been damaged in the shelling and heavy artillery. *Before the conflict started last year, post-Soviet Ukraine enjoyed roughly 23 years of religious tolerance.* When the Soviet Union broke up, a diverse number of religious were able to practice openly after years of being suppressed by the communist government. Greek Catholics, Baptists, evangelicals and Jews opened new churches or reopened shuttered ones.⁶

Describing Kiev as the cradle of east European Christianity, John Paul II appealed for unity and among all Christian Churches. He told worshippers that Ukrainians should strive to create once more the situation that existed before the 1054 Schism which split Christianity into the eastern and western churches. The Pope asked both sides to look to the past to «help restore that situation of communion in which diversity of traditions poses no obstacle to unity in faith and church life.»⁷

What will make Ukraine stronger is national dialogue, laying the foundation for unity of all Ukrainian regions based on tolerance and common values. Our strong conviction is that the core-

concept of tolerance will also start off the process of national reconciliation. Since, the idea of reconciliation as a balm with the power to heal memory is the fundamental principle of living together. Towards this end, a number of elite individuals – *teachers, journalists, and politicians* – must embark upon and lead the rest on a new path towards peace and reconciliation between peoples. They must tread this path courageously, with a «Thoughtful Heart and a Loving Mind».⁸

Respect for Ukrainian (Bukovynian) heritage and culture and acknowledgement of the traditions of the Ukrainian people is perhaps the one issue around which all Ukrainians will agree. Bukovynian descendants can be found in all walks of life. But the humanity and pride in our Bukovynian traditions which can be found throughout the works of the people with the Bukovynian background continue to inspire them and give direction to their cultural life.

Bukovyna has always been the cradle and crossroads of various cultures, languages, religions and traditions. It can be compared with multinational mosaic of Canada. Yet, still Bukovyna is facing a lot of challenges of glocalization in establishing homogeneous society with equal opportunities.

Of particular importance in fostering the fundamental principle of living in sweet harmony and peace has become the city of Chernivtsi (Czernowitz, Cernruti, Chernovtsy, Czerniowce). Currently, it's the city of multinational community with «marble cake» identity, open hearts and loving minds.

It is important to underline that Ukraine borders with Moldova and Romania in the South-West. And the south of Chernivtsi is a Ukraine-Romania border. Our city has become the case under study of EUBORDERREGIONS project «European Regions, EU External Borders and the Immediate Neighbours. Analysing Regional Development Options through Policies and Practices of Cross-Border Co-operation». The 4-year long FP7 research project Chernivtsi (Ukraine) – Iasi (Romania) – Chisinau – EU Border was launched in March 2011, with the main objective to identify challenges to economic, social and territorial cohesion as well as regional development potentials in different borderlands at the EU's external frontiers.⁹

Despite Bukovyna's unexpected historical turns, its inhabitants' experiences have led to rather stable traditions of ad hoc multiculturalism marked by a prevalent attitude of respect for the languages and customs of their compatriots with other ethnic roots, as well by an ability to sustain more than tolerant inter-ethnic relations in present-day Chernivtsi

Oblast. It is noteworthy that such relations have been distinguished by a high degree of stability. Although the tensions and conflicts that occurred in the past between Bukovyna's largest ethnic communities should not be ignored, it is important to underline that these conflicts were, as a rule, more often than not artificially instigated by policy-makers and not by the local population.¹⁰

While backtracking, we figure out that founded in the 12-th century, Chernivtsi is one of the oldest cities in Ukraine. It is a fascinating mix of all the different cultures that have converged on the region: Ukrainian, Jewish, Romanian, German, Polish, and later – Russian. A famous European figure, deputy of the European Parliament doctor Otto von Habsburg in his work titled «Chernivtsi, or What it Means to be Tolerant» described the picture of an ideal town, a home to multiethnic and multi-religious citizens. «In Chernivtsi, there was a synthesis of national consciousness and of something higher... so to speak, European attitude. Here, it was proved that various peoples... could be united in the framework of common culture...»

For centuries Chernivtsi has been formed as a multinational and multicultural city under the influence of historical events. *Tolerance* has always been one of the main city's features. Different nationalities, religions, and political beliefs have never prevented Chernivtsi citizens from living in harmony and mutual understanding. The motto «Viribus Unitis» («Joint Efforts») has been adorning the flag of Chernivtsi since 1908 not accidentally. One could hear people speaking five languages in the streets: German, Romanian, Polish, Yiddish and Ukrainian. Armenians, Czechs, Hungarians and Russians lived here and made a significant contribution to the economy and culture. Each community traditionally had its own national cultural houses – elegant buildings in the downtown. Every religious confession built and maintained its temples. Decades-long life in this diversity of nationalities, cultures and religions created a special breed of Europeans in Chernivtsi – a proud community that has called itself Chernivtsi citizens.¹¹ Chernivtsi has seen several national flags over the course of the last century, emblems of its tumultuous and difficult past. The city used to be under Romanian rule; prior to World War I, Czernowitz was the capital of the Bukowina, a Habsburg crown colony, on the Eastern edge of the Austro-Hungarian Empire. Renowned as a multi-lingual, multi-ethnic city, some see Czernowitz, as a kind of cosmopolitan ideal, where Romanians, Ukrainians, ethnic Germans, Jews, and Poles shared life¹². (As a border city whose political

allegiance changed four times over the course of the twentieth century, Chernivtsi is wracked by confusions of nationalism, nationality, ethnicity and religious identity. These conflicting layers of cultural belonging add to the complexities – and possibilities – of memory-work – including reconciliation, ignorance and silence. Independence opened up space for new historical inquiry, but it also exacerbated Ukraine's historical frictions, expressed in long-standing ethnic, religious, linguistic, and economic tensions¹³.

The multi-ethnic phenomenon of Bukovyna remains important for research as a successful example of the regional model of ethnic relations well grounded in a culture of tolerance and co-operation between major ethnic groups. The regional model of ethnic coexistence had been established in the Austrian period as a result of both internal and external factors favourable and complementary to a culture of ethnic tolerance.¹⁴

While the past divides Ukrainians, the common vision of the future may reconcile them. The common vision of the future may be ensured through the elaboration of the state policy on national unity, which should engage representatives of all Ukrainian regions in the national dialogue. The Kiev-government should learn from the wisdom of American philosopher and peace-maker Eric Hoffer stating: «A war is won only after you turned your enemy into a friend». The world needs diversity and regional responsibility to be peaceful. Canada, Switzerland, Austria or Germany could be the best practices to be profited.

To make a conclusion, the governance perspective acknowledges that any state, and therefore the government as well, still plays an important role both because of its authority, the resources which its institutions have gathered as well as the trust which some levels of government still command. However, from the point of view of governance it is important for the state not to command or use authority but to guide and steer. Because of its institutional resources, the state is able to identify powerful actors and develop linkages between them to achieve the desired goals. Tolerance is a solution to address injustice, unfairness, inequality and prejudice and it is commonly believed that a good moral person is *tolerant and tolerance* is essential for democracy and civilized life and its absence brings crimes and terrorism to society.

¹ Thorsten Knauth, *Tolerance; a key concept for dealing with cultural and religious diversity in education*, State of the art, p.2.

² World Heritage and Cultural Diversity (2010). Editors. German Commission for UNESCO Printed in Germany http://www.unesco.de/fileadmin/medien/Dokumente/Bibliothek/world_heritage_and_cultural_diversity.pdf

³ W Von Bergen, Beth A. Von Bergen, Claire Stubblefield, Diane Bandow, Authentic Tolerance: Between Forbearance and Acceptance, *Journal of Cultural Diversity*, Vol.19, No.4, winter 2012, p112.

⁴ <http://www.fresach.org/en/brussels-supports-european-tolerance-talks-2015/>

⁵ Emmanuel Agius, Jolanta Ambrosewicz, *Towards Culture of Tolerance and Peace*, 2003, International Bureau of Children's Rights, p.12.

⁶ Sabra Ayres *In rebel-held Donetsk, religious intolerance grows* <http://america.aljazeera.com/multimedia/2015/3/in-rebel-held-donetsk-religious-intolerance-grows.html>

⁷ Askold Krushelnycky *Ukraine shuns Pope's plea for unity* <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/ukraine/1310324/Ukraine-shuns-Popes-plea-for-unity.html>

⁸ *Codes of Tolerance and Respect for Each of us* http://www.codesoftolerance.com/Codes-of-Tolerance/no_author/Codes-of-Tolerance-and-Respect-for-Each-of-us.

⁹ <http://www.euborderregions.eu/en>.

¹⁰ Anatoliy Kruglashov *Bukovyna: A Border Region with a Fluctuating Identity / Confronting the Past: Ukraine and Its History / Journal of Ukrainian Studies*. Vol. 35–36, 2010–2011. – P.122.

¹¹ <http://see-you.in.ua/en/page/chernivtsi-or-what-it-means-be-tolerant>.

¹² Tony Judt, *Postwar: A History of Europe Since 1945* (New York: Penguin), 2006, p.8.

¹³ Irene Silverblatt / *Duke University Confronting Nationalisms, Cosmopolitan Visions, and the Politics of Memory: Aesthetics of Reconciliation and Selma Meerbaum-Eisinger in Western Ukraine*.

¹⁴ Anatoliy Kruglashov, *Bukovyna: A Border Region with a Fluctuating Identity / Confronting the Past: Ukraine and Its History / Journal of Ukrainian Studies*. Vol. 35–36, 2010–2011. – P.139.